

REPORT ON
MERIT SYSTEM ADMINISTRATION
FOR THE
MONTGOMERY COUNTY PERSONNEL DEPARTMENT

I FOREWORD

This report presents the findings of a Review of Merit System Administration of the Montgomery County Personnel Department, conducted in March 2007, pursuant to the provisions of section 26(2) of the Civil Service Law. The report discusses and evaluates all aspects of merit system administration of the Montgomery County Personnel Department, and includes recommendations for improving those areas in which deficiencies are identified.

The Montgomery County Personnel Officer has merit system jurisdiction over 1,525 classified service employees, of which 397 are in the County, 252 in Towns, 206 in Villages, 568 in School Districts, and 102 in Special Districts. Of these classified service employees, 461 are in the competitive class.*

*Figures are as reported by the Montgomery County Personnel Officer in the 2006 Annual Report to the State Civil Service Commission.

II SCOPE OF REVIEW

The Civil Service Law provides the Personnel Officer with a wide range of authority and responsibility for administration of the merit system in Montgomery County. Specifically, the Personnel Officer is responsible for:

1. Adopting and enforcing rules regarding employment, which includes rules pertaining to the jurisdictional classification of positions.
2. Classifying positions under his jurisdiction and maintaining a detailed classification plan.
3. Conducting an examination program to assess the merit and fitness of candidates competing for appointment in the public service.
4. Ensuring the propriety of all appointments in the classified service by certifying only those candidates deemed qualified and eligible for permanent appointment, and ensuring that all non-permanent appointments comport with the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rules.
5. Ensuring that appointing authorities submit timely reports regarding the status of the individuals they employ, and maintaining employment histories for employees under his jurisdiction.
6. Enforcing the provisions of the Civil Service Law by reviewing the payrolls of appointing authorities, resolving any discrepancies, and certifying the payrolls prior to payment.

In assessing the effectiveness of merit system administration, the reviewers examined the records maintained by the Montgomery County Personnel Department that relates to the above functions, and considered other factors, such as the agency's hours of operation, internal controls established to ensure efficient operations and the adequacy of the resources dedicated to merit system administration.

III SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Overall, the administration of civil service in the Montgomery County Personnel Department is rated as “Good.”

The administration of the merit system by the Montgomery County Personnel Department was generally effective, but each of the above program areas can be strengthened to improve merit system administration.

Although all required provisions are included in the Text of the Rules, the Appendices to the Rules, which contain titles officially removed from the competitive class, needs to be updated. The review found 57 titles in use, which are considered outside the competitive class, that are not listed in the Rules Appendices. Persons serving in these titles do not possess civil service status and have not been offered the opportunity to obtain status.

The Personnel Officer appears to actively classify positions, but there are 25 titles for which a class specification is not available. The Montgomery County Civil Service Rules require the Personnel Officer to adopt a class specification for all positions in the classified service.

The examination program is effectively administered; however, the review found a low number of candidates participating in competitive examinations and recruitment could be improved. All permanent appointments from eligible lists were made appropriately. However, the percentage of competitive class positions filled by provisional appointment is double that for county civil service agencies in the state. By improving its recruitment efforts, the Personnel Officer could increase the number of qualified candidates participating in examinations that would result in eligible lists containing the names of more eligibles, and allow for permanent rather than provisional appointments.

The Personnel Officer uses an electronic system to maintain employee history files. The system is effectively maintained and only a few minor discrepancies were noted.

The review found that although the Personnel Officer receives and certifies payrolls from all agencies under its jurisdiction, with the exception of the County, they are not being certified prior to payment. Once the payroll is received and reviewed, the Personnel Officer attempts to resolve any discrepancies noted.

The Montgomery County Personnel Officer’s performance of these as well as other related functions is discussed in detail in this Report, along with recommendations to come into compliance with the Civil Service Law and to improve merit system administration.

The following is a listing of recommendations for the Montgomery County Personnel Officer to come into compliance with the Civil Service Law and Rules and to improve merit system administration.

**RECOMMENDATIONS TO COME INTO COMPLIANCE WITH CIVIL
SERVICE LAW AND/OR RULES**

- 1. The Personnel Officer must review the duties and responsibilities performed by individuals in the titles listed in Schedule A as other than competitive, but not officially listed in the Rules, and determine if the titles merit removal from the competitive class. If so, the Personnel Officer must follow the procedures outlined in section 20(2) of the Civil Service Law to amend the Appendices to the Rules. (See page 8)**
- 2. The Personnel Officer must adopt a procedure to fulfill his obligation, as required by section 41(2) of the Civil Service Law, to review the duties and responsibilities of exempt class positions located in non-county agencies upon the occurrence of a vacancy. (See page 8)**
- 3. The Personnel Officer must review the duties and responsibilities of each of the positions listed in Schedule B and either assign the position to an existing class or adopt a new classification. Additionally, if the Personnel Officer determines that it is unnecessary to maintain class specifications for exempt class positions, the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules must be amended to delete the requirement to maintain specifications for exempt class positions. (See page 10)**
- 4. The Personnel Officer must review the class specification for Assessor and amend the minimum qualifications as required by Part 188 of the Rules and Regulations of the State Board of Real Property Tax Services. (See page 10)**
- 5. The Personnel Officer must ensure that eligible lists contain complete and detailed information relative to canvasses, certifications and appointments and reasons for candidate declinations, as required by Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XI(4). (See page 21)**
- 6. The Personnel Officer must ensure appointments are made from certifications in accordance with Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XI(2). (See page 21)**
- 7. The Personnel Officer must establish and maintain a roster of all veterans appointed and promoted to positions under his jurisdiction as a result of the use of veterans' credits as provided by section 85(6) of Civil Service Law. The Personnel Officer must also take steps to ensure that veterans' credits are used only once for appointment. (See page 22)**
- 8. The Personnel Officer must review the qualifications of six provisional appointees serving at the time of this review that do not appear to meet the minimum qualifications for their respective position. If they are found to be not qualified, the Personnel Officer must direct that they be removed from their position or take other appropriate action as necessary. (See page 25)**

- 9. The Personnel Officer should continue to closely monitor the appointment of provisional appointees and establish a procedure to ensure that examination requests are submitted within one month of the date of provisional appointment in accordance with section 65(2) of Civil Service Law. (See page 25)**
- 10. The Personnel Officer must ensure that applications of all nominees for non-competitive class appointments are submitted and reviewed prior to appointment as required by section 42(1) of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rule III. (See page 26)**
- 11. The Personnel Officer must review the roster record discrepancies identified on the separate listing, and confirm the correct status, jurisdictional classification, and authorization for appointment for each employee. (See page 28)**
- 12. The Personnel Officer must certify payrolls for all jurisdictions prior to payment in accordance with section 100 of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XXI. (See page 29)**

RECOMMENDATION TO IMPROVE MERIT SYSTEM ADMINISTRATION

- 1. The Personnel Officer should implement strategies outlined in the report to enhance the recruitment of candidates for competitive examinations.
(See page 18)**

III RULES

The New York State Civil Service Law, section 20(1) requires the Personnel Officer to prescribe and enforce rules for carrying out the provisions of Article V, section 6 of the New York State Constitution. The Civil Service Rules have the force and effect of law, and apply to all positions in the classified service.

The Rules consist of two parts, the Text and the Appendices. The Personnel Officer may amend the Rules subsequent to a public hearing, the adoption of a formal resolution, and the approval of the State Civil Service Commission. An amendment becomes effective upon the State Civil Service Commission approving and filing it with the Secretary of State.

A copy of the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules is provided to all agencies under the Personnel Officer's jurisdiction and they are available at the Personnel Department for review. In addition, a copy is provided to newly appointed department heads at employee orientation.

Text

The Montgomery County Personnel Officer made several revisions to the Text of the Rules in February 2003. The Text of the Rules contains all provisions required by Civil Service Law.

Appendices

The Appendices to the Rules list all classified and unclassified titles that have been formally removed from the competitive class. The jurisdictional classification of a position determines the method of selection used to make an appointment to the position, and the rights of the incumbent in the position. It is critical that the Rules Appendices be accurate and up-to-date.

The Personnel Officer does not routinely review and address the jurisdictional classification of positions under his jurisdiction. The most recent revision to the Rule Appendices occurred in 2003. At the time of the review, no rules resolution was being prepared by the Personnel Officer.

A comparison of titles currently in use that are considered by the Montgomery County Personnel Officer as outside the competitive class were reviewed against the titles listed in the Rules Appendices as officially removed from the competitive class. Fifty-seven titles were identified which have not been formally added to the Rules. There are over 60 employees currently serving in the 57 titles. These titles are listed on Schedule A at the end of this report.

Of the 57 titles listed on Schedule A, 15 are listed as pending jurisdictional classification. These titles are listed as pending because the Personnel Officer has not made a determination on the jurisdictional class to which they will be assigned or taken any steps to officially remove the titles from the competitive class. The incumbents in

titles identified as pending jurisdictional classification have been serving in their respective titles in excess of one year. For example, one individual employed by the County is serving in a pending title with an appointment date of 2003; an individual employed by a town is serving in a pending title with an appointment date of 2000; and another individual employed by a school district is serving in a pending title with an appointment date of 1998. It is imperative that the jurisdictional classification of titles be officially established without delay. Individuals serving in positions, whose titles are pending jurisdictional classification, as well as other interested qualified candidates, are being denied the opportunity to obtain permanent status and the rights that would derive from this status.

The Personnel Officer must review the duties and responsibilities performed by individuals in the titles listed in Schedule A as other than competitive, but not officially listed in the Rules, and determine if the titles merit removal from the competitive class. If so, the Personnel Officer must follow the procedures outlined in section 20(2) of the Civil Service Law to amend the Appendices to the Rules.

Exempt Class Review

Section 41(2) of the Civil Service Law requires that the Personnel Officer study and evaluate exempt class positions within four months after they become vacant to determine if such positions should continue in the exempt class or be placed in another classification.

The Personnel Officer has a procedure to review vacant exempt class County positions within four months as required by section 41(2) of the Civil Service Law. He does so by obtaining new position duties statements for the position upon vacancy. There is no procedure currently in place to review the duties and responsibilities of exempt class non-county positions as they become vacant to determine if they should remain in the exempt class.

The Personnel Officer must adopt a procedure to fulfill his obligation, as required by section 41(2) of the Civil Service Law, to review the duties and responsibilities of exempt class positions located in non-county agencies upon the occurrence of a vacancy.

IV CLASSIFICATION

An established classification plan provides the Personnel Officer with a detailed statement of the nature of the work required for each class of position as well as the minimum qualifications that are required of the employee for successful performance on the job. By standardizing class titles, the classification plan provides appointing authorities with a defined means of expressing their personnel needs.

Section 22 of the Civil Service Law requires that prior to the creation of a new position or reclassification of an existing position, a statement of the duties and responsibilities of the position must be provided to the Personnel Officer. The Personnel Officer must then study the duties and responsibilities and determine the proper classification for the position. The Personnel Officer must then either assign the position to an appropriate job class or, if one does not exist, create a new class and prepare an appropriate class specification.

It is important that position classification be performed prior to the filling of a new or reclassified position so that employees who are hired meet the minimum qualifications and are able to perform the duties of the position. Accurate class specifications with appropriate minimum qualifications provide the basis for many areas of civil service administration, including jurisdictional classification, examination administration, and control of temporary and provisional appointments. Until a position is properly classified and appropriate minimum qualifications are established, it cannot be assigned to a jurisdictional classification, no examination can be held, and an incumbent cannot attain permanent civil service status.

Classification Plan

The Montgomery County Classification Plan is organized alphabetically by title and is maintained in loose leaf binders. Copies of relevant class specifications are provided to appointing authorities and agency department heads, and a copy of the entire Classification Plan is available for review upon request in the Personnel Department.

The Personnel Officer is responsible not only for the preparation of class specifications for all positions in the classified service, but also for maintaining class specifications that are current and reflective of the duties and responsibilities of the position. A review of the class specifications on file found that in the mid-1990's the Personnel Officer began implementing a new format for newly adopted or revised class specifications and this format distinguishes the newer class specifications from those that are over 20 years old. In addition, the newer class specifications include adoption and revision dates, while the older class specifications may or may not include an adoption date, and do not include revision dates. In general, the formatting differences notwithstanding, the class specifications are comprehensive, internally consistent, and contain reasonable minimum qualifications.

A comparison of the titles in the roster record against the titles listed in the Personnel Department's Classification Plan identified 25 titles for which a class specification is not available. The titles without specifications are listed in Schedule B at

the end of this report. Of the 25 titles listed in schedule B as having no class specification available, 13 are listed in the exempt class in the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules Appendices. Rule XXI (2) of the Text of the Rules requires the adoption of a class specification for all positions in the classified service which includes exempt class titles.

The Personnel Officer must review the duties and responsibilities of each of the positions listed in Schedule B and either assign the position to an existing class or adopt a new classification. Additionally, if the Personnel Officer determines that it is unnecessary to maintain class specifications for exempt class positions, the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules must be amended to delete the requirement to maintain specifications for exempt class positions.

Systematic Review

The Personnel Officer does not have a plan to systematically review the classification of positions; it is done on an individual, as needed basis and prior to ordering examinations. A systematic review would include a comparative analysis of positions to ensure equal treatment of positions across departments, standardize the interpretation of general terms used in class specifications and allow boundaries between classes to be more clearly distinguished.

Although the Personnel Officer has not established a systematic review of the classification of positions, the class specifications are up-to-date with the exception of the one for Assessor.

The minimum qualifications for local Assessors are mandated under Part 188 of the Rules and Regulations of the State Board of Real Property Tax Services. Part 188, including minimum qualifications, were amended in 1997. The Montgomery County class specification contains a notation that it was adopted in 1995. The minimum qualifications are similar to those promulgated in 1997 but do not list all of the alternatives found in the Rules and Regulations by which a candidate may qualify.

The Personnel Officer must review the class specification for Assessor and amend the minimum qualifications as required by Part 188 of the Rules and Regulations of the State Board of Real Property Tax Services.

New and Existing Position Classification

Section 22 of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XXII(4), requires that prior to the creation of a new position, a detailed statement of the duties and responsibilities of the position must be provided to the Personnel Officer. The Personnel Officer must then analyze the duties and responsibilities and determine the proper classification for the position. If necessary, the Personnel Officer may have to create a new class and prepare a classification specification containing appropriate

minimum qualifications. A classification specification must be developed prior to the position's creation to ensure that appointees' possess the training and experience required to perform the duties of the position.

In general, the Personnel Officer receives a New Position Duties Statement prior to the creation of a new position under his jurisdiction as required by section 22 of the Civil Service Law and Rule XXII(4) of the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules.

V EXAMINATION PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS

The examination program is the most visible activity undertaken by a civil service agency. The credibility of, and public trust in, the municipally administered merit system is predicated on the integrity of the entire examination process. Any question regarding the integrity of any aspect of the examination program, whether real or perceived, adversely affects the agency. The manner in which examinations are planned, announced and administered, as well as the fair and proper review of applications, establishment of eligible lists, and the management of eligible list certifications, including appointments made from such lists, all contribute to the public perception of fairness, trust and confidence in the merit and fitness program.

Measures of Examination Program Effectiveness

Four major functions relating to the effectiveness of the Montgomery Personnel Department's examination program were evaluated in conjunction with this review.

1. ***Examination Planning*** – the Personnel Department's effective use of information and related examination services to manage an examination schedule that meets agency appointment needs, e.g., New York State Department of Civil Service Local Examination Master Schedule, agency-anticipated vacancy information, anticipated eligible list exhaustion dates and other relevant information.
2. ***Recruitment of Personnel*** – the Personnel Department's effective development and distribution of examination announcement information and publicity given to job vacancies and the effective development of public and employee interest in job openings and promotion opportunities. Examination announcements are the primary tool in recruitment for competitive class positions. Accordingly, announcements should contain all necessary information required by the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules as well as information related to the duties of the position, the examination, and the application process. In conjunction with its recruitment effort, the County's application review is the first step in the examination process. Of utmost importance is the manner in which applications are evaluated; uniform standards must be used in reviewing applications for all individuals who apply.
3. ***Test Administration*** – the Personnel Department's practices regarding the scheduling, staffing, logistics of administering a civil service testing program to support the fair and equal testing of candidates seeking employment in the public service, as well as its efforts to maintain the security and integrity of test-related documents.
4. ***Eligible List Maintenance*** – the Personnel Department's practices regarding the processing of examination results and the use and management of eligible lists and the certification process which directly impact the fairness, openness, timeliness, completeness and accuracy of the entire civil service appointments process.

Examination Planning

It is vital that the Personnel Officer manage his merit system administration so that all interested potential candidates compete on a level playing field for appointment. To meet this objective, the Personnel Officer needs to request examination assistance in anticipation of vacancies. There does not have to be a vacancy in order for an examination to be requested. In fact, the Personnel Officer should be anticipating vacancies and administering examinations to have eligible lists on hand as needed. In the event an eligible list containing three or more names of qualified candidates (a “mandatory” eligible list) does not exist and a provisional appointment is authorized, section 65(2) of the Civil Service Law requires that an examination request be made within one month of the making of the provisional appointment.

To this end, the Personnel Officer must identify, anticipate and plan for examination needs well in advance of the occurrence of vacancies. Effective examination program planning and administration requires using all available tools and management techniques. The Personnel Officer must analyze, evaluate and use several factors to anticipate the need for and have available viable eligible lists. Some of these factors include:

- using available information and resources such as the Examination Schedule published by the New York State Department of Civil Service. The Master Examination Schedule contains the yearly schedule of examinations offered by the New York State Department of Civil Service;
- identifying with appointing authorities the normal turnover rates, anticipated retirements and probable appointments in agencies and civil divisions;
- monitoring the number of candidates on existing eligible lists;
- reviewing recent canvass results of eligible lists to identify difficult-to-fill positions;
- monitoring the expiration dates of eligible lists and routinely ordering and scheduling examinations to have eligible lists available;
- maintaining close communication with appointing authorities to be informed of anticipated programmatic reductions or expansions, or the implementation of new programs;
- discussing succession planning with department and agency heads, including the compilation of agency demographics.

To support the Personnel Officer in fulfilling his obligation to effectively administer the competitive selection process, the New York State Department of Civil Service offers examination services in the form of “centralized” and “decentralized” examinations. Centralized and decentralized examinations differ in terms of the schedule

and flexibility of test dates. Centralized examinations are scheduled on predetermined dates by the New York State Department of Civil Service. Decentralized examinations are scheduled as needed by the municipal civil service agency.

Ordering Examinations:

The key to good examination planning is the administration of examinations and establishment of eligible lists prior to a vacancy occurring. This is best accomplished through periodic reviews of staffing needs with program managers to anticipate vacancies.

A review of the procedures by which examinations are ordered indicates that, with the exception of 18 instances for which examinations were not ordered within 30 days of a provisional appointment which is discussed in the “Provisional Appointments” section of this report, the Montgomery Personnel Department typically does attempt to anticipate vacancies and plan for the administration of needed civil service examinations. In doing so, the Personnel Officer has implemented procedures to periodically review staffing needs with program managers to anticipate future vacancies; thereby enhancing his ability to have eligible lists available from which to make permanent appointments and reducing the need for provisional appointments. In addition, the Personnel Department staff review annual budget requests, Board of Education notices and employee retirement notices in order to anticipate staffing needs of agencies under the jurisdiction of the Personnel Officer.

Centralized Examinations:

For the period April 1, 2004, through March 15, 2007, the Montgomery Personnel Department completed 75 examinations prepared and rated by the New York State Department of Civil Service. From these examinations, 73 eligible lists were established resulting in 118 permanent appointments. Two examinations produced no passing candidates.

The following chart illustrates the number of centralized open competitive (OC) and promotion examinations completed during each year covered by the review, as well as the number of passed candidates and the number of permanent appointments made from the open competitive and promotion eligible lists.

Year	Number of Examinations Completed		Number of Passed Candidates		Number of Permanent Appointments from Eligible Lists	
	OC	Promotion	OC	Promotion	OC	Promotion
2004*	13	13	43	19	26	2
2005	15	6	100	18	35	7
2006	14	6	121	9	35	12
2007**	7	1	57	1	0	1
Totals	49	26	321	47	96	22

*April 1 – December 31, 2004

**January 1 – March 15, 2007

The above chart shows that of the 75 examinations completed by the Montgomery County Personnel Department, 49 were conducted on an open competitive basis and 26 were conducted on a promotional basis. An important objective of an effectively managed examination program is the establishment of eligible lists containing sufficient number of candidates from which permanent appointments may be made. While the above table demonstrates that the Personnel Officer is conducting an active centralized civil service examination program, it was noted that the examinations are not attracting candidates in sufficient numbers to meet the long-term staffing needs of appointing officers.

An analysis of the eligible lists established between April 1, 2004, and March 15, 2007, shows that only 27 (55%) of the 49 open competitive examinations resulted in eligible lists containing the names of at least three passed candidates. During this same period, Montgomery County established 26 promotion examinations only 4 (15%) of which resulted in eligible lists containing at least three passed candidates. Inasmuch as the promotion field may be limited, it is recognized that the percentage of promotion examinations resulting in the establishment of mandatory eligible lists is expected to be lower than those for open-competitive examinations.

Given the small number of candidates participating in the County's examinations, appointing authorities are often being provided with a limited list of names from which to make permanent appointments. Consequently, the lack of candidate participation in the Montgomery County civil service examination program increases the likelihood for the need to make provisional appointments. This is confirmed by the information found in the Provisional Appointments section of this report. In conjunction with this observation it was determined that, in many cases, the eligible lists resulting from the examination program did not contain sufficient numbers of candidates to provide a mandatory eligible list for more than one appointment.

Decentralized Examinations:

The scheduling and administration of decentralized examinations is determined by the needs of the Montgomery County Personnel Department. The program is designed to give the Personnel Department the means to offer examinations in accordance with appointing officer needs, to score test papers immediately, and to certify eligible lists to appointing authorities promptly.

The Personnel Department conducted an active decentralized examination program during the review period in that 97 candidates participated in the decentralized examination program resulting in 26 appointments. The decentralized examinations offered during the review period included the following:

- Typist
- Clerk Typist
- Senior Clerk Typist
- Caseworker
- Account Clerk
- Account Clerk Typist

- Stenographer
- Senior Stenographer
- Network Systems Coordinator
- Micro-Computer Technician
- Head Nurse
- Supervising Nurse

However, one provisional appointment dating back to 2005 was identified for an Occupational Therapist title which is included in the decentralized examination program. On being advised of the Occupational Therapist decentralized examination, the Personnel Officer completed the examination and the individual was subsequently given a permanent competitive class appointment.

This instance, notwithstanding the review, found that the Montgomery County Personnel Department effectively manages its decentralized examination program.

Recruitment of Personnel

The basic premise of the civil service system, embodied in the New York State Constitution, is that the selection of employees in the public service shall be based on merit and fitness, to be ascertained, as far as practicable, through competitive examination. Lacking an adequate number of qualified candidates participating in the examination program as referenced earlier in this report, the competitiveness of the merit and fitness program is diminished. An active recruitment program is the most effective way a municipal civil service agency can ensure the principles of merit and fitness are upheld.

Announcement of Examinations

Examination announcements are used by a municipal civil service agency as the primary recruitment tool for competitive class positions. The official announcement and publicity given to current vacancies and anticipated vacancies are crucial in developing public and employee interest in vacancies. Examination announcements are intended to provide the general public and promotion examination candidates with sufficient information to make informed decisions as to their interest in jobs and whether or not they are qualified to compete. Toward this end announcements should be designed to draw attention to vacancies; be written in clear, easily understood language; contain all necessary information related to the position; and clearly state the minimum qualifications, the subjects of examination, and the application submission process.

During this review it was determined that the Montgomery County examination announcements contain all information required by section 50(2) of the Civil Service Law as well as section VI(2) of the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules. The announcements specify the title of the position to be examined, the salary or salary range to be paid incumbents of the position, the position's duties, the minimum qualifications, the last date for filing applications, the application fee, the subjects of examination, and the date of test administration. Residency statements are included where applicable. The

announcements also asks Saturday religious observers and disabled persons to indicate whether special arrangements are needed and provides information to candidates who may also file for examinations to be conducted on the same test date in other jurisdictions.

The Personnel Department also takes advantage of the Montgomery County Government WEB site to provide recruitment related information in the form of "Job Postings." The WEB site does not include examination announcements for upcoming examinations, but rather lists job opportunities available within the County for positions that are other-than-competitive or for competitive class positions where a provisional appointment is anticipated. Job postings on the WEB site to fill a position on a provisional basis contain information typically found on an examination announcement such as the title of the position, salary, location, residency and minimum qualifications and it also includes information pertaining to the examination requirements that will be necessary for permanent appointment. During this review, it was determined that the Montgomery County Personnel Department is working with the County's Information Technology staff to add examination announcements and applications to the Department's WEB site. Doing so should serve to enhance the County's recruitment efforts and increase candidate participation in its examinations.

The Personnel Officer has established procedures for the distribution of examination announcements. Announcements are distributed to over 70 offices within and contiguous to Montgomery County.

Recruitment Indicators:

There are two main indicators of recruitment effort effectiveness: 1) the number of candidates participating in examinations; and 2) the number of mandatory eligible lists generated from these examinations. As illustrated earlier in this report, 55 percent of the open competitive examinations held during the review period resulted in the establishment of eligible lists having more than three passing candidates. Conversely, 45 percent of the eligible lists contained two or fewer names of candidates from which appointments could be made and therefore were not mandatory eligible lists.

Even though over 50 percent of the time department heads are provided with a mandatory eligible list from which to make a permanent appointment, the review found that there is a significant amount of turnover, particularly for County positions. As a consequence, department heads routinely deplete these lists within a relatively short period of time. The multiple appointments resulting from high turnover and the depletion of eligible lists, combined with the percentage of eligible lists established that are non-mandatory, indicates that the Personnel Department is not able to attract sufficient numbers of candidates to participate in examinations to meet the staffing demands of the agencies under the Personnel Officer's jurisdiction.

The following four actions would enhance the recruitment of candidates.

- Montgomery County has a WEB site that includes job related information for current vacancies within the county; however, the WEB site does not include examination announcements for upcoming examinations, access to

examination application forms which can be printed, completed and submitted. The Personnel Officer should explore the possibility of enhancing the WEB site to include this service.

- The Personnel Officer should consider suspending or reducing residence requirements as authorized under the Montgomery County Civil Service Rule VI(1) (Recruitment of Personnel) for examinations where aggravated recruitment is a problem.
- The Personnel Officer should explore the use of trainee positions to attract candidates with lower qualifications to serve a period of training to learn to perform the duties and responsibilities of journey-level positions.
- The Personnel Officer should take a proactive approach to recruitment such as participation in job fairs or recruitment at local schools and colleges. The Personnel Officer should also involve the agencies under his jurisdiction in its recruitment activities.

The Personnel Officer should implement strategies outlined in the report to enhance the recruitment of candidates for competitive examinations.

Application Review:

Candidates for competitive examination must file an application for examination within a prescribed period. Prior to the holding of an examination, the Montgomery County Personnel Department must review the applications of candidates to determine if they possess the required minimum qualifications. The review of candidates' applications is the first critical step in the competitive selection process. The manner in which applications are fairly and properly reviewed will ensure a public perception of fairness as well as ensuring that only qualified individuals are allowed to compete for appointment consideration.

During the application review process, the evaluation of education and experience must be measured objectively against the announced minimum qualifications. A fair and objective evaluation is necessary to screen out unqualified candidates, while at the same time affording all qualified candidates an opportunity to participate in the competitive examination process. This process is intended to assure that all applicants have their applications fairly and consistently evaluated.

The Montgomery County Personnel Department effectively reviews applications for examinations. During this review an assessment of candidates' applications for competitive examinations conducted over the last three years was evaluated against the announced minimum qualifications for their positions. The applications are date stamped and the qualifications of candidates were correctly evaluated. Approval or disapproval determinations were noted on the open-competitive examination applications as well as indications as to what education or experience is being credited towards meeting the minimum qualifications. These are sound application review practices and afford any reviewer the opportunity to quickly and easily determine the basis for approval or

disapproval of each applicant. The only exceptions to the above described application processing practice noted during this review was for the March 19, 2005 Correction Officer Exam, No. 69-894, and the March 5, 2005 Police Chief Promotion Examination, No. 77-619. In the first instance, a limited number of applications of qualified candidates were not marked approved; and for the latter Police Chief Promotion examination, none of the candidates in this promotion field had approvals indicated on their applications. Nevertheless, a review of the candidate applications for both examinations indicated that all candidates participating in the examinations met the qualifications and the lack of applicant markings in these noted instances were exceptions to the common practice in the Montgomery County Personnel Department.

Test Administration

To maintain public trust in the civil service system, the security and integrity of the Montgomery County Personnel Department's testing program must be stringently maintained. The Personnel Department has the ultimate responsibility for ensuring the security and integrity of the examination program within its jurisdiction. A review of test administration procedures found that the Personnel Department staff maintains a sufficient number of trained monitors and staff who assist with the tracking of secure examination related materials. Secure test materials are accounted for by the Personnel Department from the time it is received from the New York State Department of Civil Service, through test administration, and to the point that examination materials are returned to the New York State Department of Civil Service.

Appropriate and necessary security practices are in place to ensure the safekeeping of test materials in the Personnel Department as well as all candidate answer records and sensitive, confidential test related information. The Test Center Supervisor responsible for the oversight of test administrations effectively manages the distribution and return of test materials in a manner that safeguards the security and integrity of sensitive test material. Test monitor turnover is limited, and new test administration staff is provided appropriate training and orientation by the Personnel Department staff as needed.

The relatively low number of Critical Incident reports submitted by the Personnel Department to the New York State Department of Civil Service indicates that the test administration practices are being well managed, resulting in uncomplicated and uneventful test administrations. This is an indication that the Personnel Department is appropriately managing its obligations and responsibilities for the safekeeping of test materials as well as the conduct of tests.

Alternate Test Date Policy

Section 70.4 of the New York State Civil Service Commission President's Regulations requires that tests be administered only on the announced date; under this regulation, municipal civil service agencies are authorized to adopt policies which allow alternate date testing under certain circumstances. A written alternate test date policy is required to conduct tests prepared by the New York State Department of Civil Service on an alternate date. During this review, it was determined that the Montgomery County Personnel Officer has established a written Alternate Test Date Policy that clearly

articulates the circumstances for which an alternate test date will be permitted. In addition, the policy also provides the procedure that must be followed for requesting an alternate test date. In keeping with the State Department of Civil Service's established procedures, Montgomery County routinely informs New York State when such alternate test arrangements are made.

Eligible List Maintenance

Section 56 of the Civil Service Law requires that the Montgomery County Personnel Officer establish and maintain eligible lists. The preparation and maintenance of eligible lists are critical elements of the competitive selection process, and are central to the integrity of the merit system. Accurately prepared and maintained eligible lists also help to ensure that appointing authorities have the opportunity to make appointments from among the most qualified candidates. They also ensure that candidates are afforded the rights and benefits they are entitled to under the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rules. An eligible list is a public document, and the manner in which an eligible list is prepared and maintained is central to the public's perception of how the merit system is being administered.

The Personnel Department prepares eligible lists electronically, and also maintains paper copies which are filed in hard-covered binders. The eligible lists are maintained through data entry of information into the computer system, with a new copy of the eligible list generated after new entries are made. The eligible lists contain the title and examination number, date of establishment and expiration, the eligible's name, address, and final examination rating. Generally, all eligible lists are established for four years.

Canvass and Certification

A well-maintained eligible list will contain information regarding the results of canvasses, certification of eligibles, and appointments.

The results of general canvassing, including an eligible candidate's availability for appointment or lack of interest in the position offered and the reason for their declination and the date of their response should be entered on the eligible list. A non-response to a canvass letter should also be entered on the eligible list.

An entry should be made on the eligible list indicating that a certification has been made. The entry should include:

1. The date of the certification;
2. The name of the agency to which the certification is issued;
3. The salary or salary range of the position offered;
4. Whether the certification was for a permanent, contingent permanent, or temporary vacancy;
5. Whether the certification was for a full-time or part-time position.

If an appointment is made from the certification, the above information regarding the appointment should be entered on the eligible list.

The recording of the above information on the eligible list will provide a clear record of the use of the list by showing declinations received, how individuals were reached, and the type and number of appointments made.

The Personnel Department's eligible lists do not consistently list canvass and certification information. In addition, the eligible lists only provided limited appointment information. Critical information, such as salary, the type of appointment, (i.e., permanent, or temporary) and nature of appointment (full-time or part-time) are not always included. This information is particularly crucial if candidates decline a particular position for a specific reason, such as insufficient salary or a part-time appointment. It is important that all certification and appointment information is appropriately entered on eligible lists to permit any interested person to readily confirm the propriety of any appointment.

Since most of the eligible lists reviewed contained a small number of names, the propriety of appointments could be easily confirmed. There were a few instances; however, where the propriety of an appointment could not be confirmed from the information available on the eligible list. In those instances, Personnel Department staff produced the necessary source documents during the course of the review to verify the propriety of these appointments.

The Personnel Officer must ensure that eligible lists contain complete and detailed information relative to canvasses, certifications and appointments and reasons for candidate declinations, as required by Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XI(4).

Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XI(2) provides that a certification issued by the Personnel Officer to an appointing authority is valid for a thirty day period and no appointment shall be made after the expiration except from a new certification. The Rule also allows for the extension of a certification for an additional thirty days for good cause.

Therefore, in accordance with the Rule, appointments from eligible lists must be made within the thirty day certification period. In two instances, it was noted that appointments were made from a valid eligible list but beyond the thirty day certification period or approved extension. There was nothing noted in the file to indicate the Personnel Officer had extended the certification for an additional thirty days in either of these instances.

The Personnel Officer must ensure appointments are made from certifications in accordance with Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XI(2).

Veterans' Credit Roster:

Section 85(6) of the Civil Service Law requires that the civil service maintain a record of candidates who have claimed and used veterans' credits to receive permanent competitive appointments. The reason section 85(6) requires a veterans' credit roster is because the New York State Constitution allows for the use of veterans' credits for appointment only once. The Personnel Officer maintains a file of applications of individuals that request veterans' credit but the list does not indicate credit usage. A small number of eligible lists indicate that candidates were granted additional veterans' credits. The Personnel Officer does not maintain a veterans' credit roster as required by law. Further, the Personnel Officer does not check with other civil service agencies to determine if candidates may have used their veterans' credits.

By not maintaining a veterans' credit roster and tracking the use of veterans' credits, the Personnel Officer does not know if a candidate has previously used their veteran's credits for appointment under his or another jurisdiction. Also, by not maintaining a veterans' credit roster, other civil service agencies cannot check with the Personnel Officer to determine if a particular candidate has used veterans' credits to obtain a permanent appointment in Montgomery County.

The Personnel Officer must establish and maintain a roster of all veterans appointed and promoted to positions under his jurisdiction as a result of the use of veterans' credits as provided by section 85(6) of Civil Service Law. The Personnel Officer must also take steps to ensure that veterans' credits are used only once for appointment.

VI APPOINTMENTS

Permanent Appointments

The civil service system is founded on the principle that appointments to positions in the public service will be made on the basis of merit and fitness demonstrated as far as practicable by competitive examination. Section 61 of the Civil Service Law requires that competitive positions be filled by the appointment of one of the top three eligibles on an appropriate eligible list who are willing to accept appointment. Permanent appointments to the competitive class provide employees with a number of rights, most notably retention rights in the event of a reduction in force, that differ from other types of appointment in the classified service.

The propriety of an appointment to a competitive class position can be confirmed by reviewing the appropriate eligible list, certifications issued and documentation describing the action taken by the appointing authority to effectuate the appointment. A review of 144 permanent competitive class appointments made during the previous three years was conducted to ensure that they were made in accordance with Civil Service Law and Rules. One hundred eighteen permanent appointments were made from eligible lists established based on centralized examinations and 26 permanent appointments were made from eligible lists established from decentralized examinations. This was a complete review of all permanent, competitive class appointments made during the period under review. Each appointment was made from an appropriate eligible list in conformance with the requirements of section 61 of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rules.

Provisional Appointments

Section 65.1 of the Civil Service Law allows appointing authorities, with approval of the Personnel Officer, to fill positions in the competitive class on a provisional basis when there is no appropriate eligible list available to fill the position on a permanent basis. Provisional appointments are a non-tenured method of filling competitive class positions with individuals who meet the minimum qualifications, pending the holding of an examination and the establishment of an appropriate eligible list. Section 65.2 of the Civil Service Law also requires that an examination plan be put in process within one month of the making of a provisional appointment. Provisional appointees must participate in the next scheduled examination for the position and be among the top three candidates on the resulting eligible list in order to receive a permanent appointment. Every effort should be made by the Personnel Department to avoid the necessity of provisional appointments and once such an appointment becomes necessary, to limit their duration.

Provisional Appointments Summary

The following chart represents a summary of provisional appointments:

	<u>Present Number</u>	<u>Percent of Competitive Employees</u>
Competitive Class Employees	461	--
Provisional Employees	67	14.5%
Provisionals Serving with No Examination in Process	12	2.6%

Number of Provisional Appointments

According to the 2006 Montgomery County Annual Report, there were 461 competitive class positions under the jurisdiction of the Montgomery Personnel Officer. At the time of the review, 67 positions, or 14.5 percent, were filled on a provisional basis. The current number of provisional appointments to competitive class positions within Montgomery County is consistent with the high rates of provisional appointments reported in the 2005 (11.9 percent) and 2004 (14.5 percent) Montgomery County Annual Reports. The Montgomery County rate of provisional appointments in each of the three preceding years is more than double that of the average for counties statewide.

Section 65(1) of the Civil Service Law provides that absent an eligible list, an appointing authority may nominate a person to the Montgomery County Personnel Officer for non-competitive examination and, if such nominee is found to be qualified, he or she may be appointed provisionally to fill the position until selection and appointment can be made following a competitive examination. Pursuant to section 65(1), the Personnel Officer is required to review applications prior to appointment. This review entails a comparison and analysis of the nominee's qualifications against the officially adopted minimum qualifications prescribed for the position as stated on the class specification and a determination of applicants being qualified or not qualified for the position.

The majority of applications of provisional nominees met the minimum qualifications for their respective position. Problems were identified involving the application review for six provisional appointees. In some instances, the information provided by the applicant was missing, unclear, or insufficient to determine if the person met the established minimum qualifications. Certain applications failed to identify the title of the position for which the individual was applying. In other cases, the Personnel

Officer appears to have accepted experience not related to that required in the minimum qualifications as "an equivalent combination of training and experience." Additional information must be obtained from each of these provisionals in order to determine if they meet the qualifications for the positions they hold. The names and titles of the six provisional employees have been forwarded to the Personnel Officer under separate cover.

The Personnel Officer must review the qualifications of six provisional appointees serving at the time of this review that do not appear to meet the minimum qualifications for their respective position. If they are found to be not qualified, the Personnel Officer must direct that they be removed from their position or take other appropriate action as necessary.

Section 65(2) of the Civil Service Law also requires that the Montgomery County Personnel Department initiate the examination process within one month of authorizing a provisional appointment. At the time of this review, examination requests were ordered for 55 of the 67 positions filled on a provisional basis. In addition to the 12 positions for which no examination had been requested, it was noted that the examination requests for 6 other positions, for which provisional appointments were made, did not have examination requests submitted within the required one month time period. At the time of the review, examinations for only 49 of the 67 provisional appointments, or 73 percent, had been ordered within the time period prescribed by section 65(2) of the Civil Service Law. Subsequent to the review, the Personnel Officer submitted an examination requests for each of the 12 titles filled by provisional appointment for which no examination had been ordered.

The Personnel Officer should continue to closely monitor the appointment of provisional appointees and establish a procedure to ensure that examination requests are submitted within one month of the date of provisional appointment in accordance with section 65(2) of Civil Service Law.

Section 65(3) of the Civil Service Law provides that a provisional appointment to any position shall be terminated within two months following the establishment of an appropriate eligible list. At the time of this review, there were no provisional appointees serving in the face of an appropriate eligible list.

Temporary Appointments

Section 64 of the Civil Service Law authorizes temporary appointments, under specific conditions, for up to three months without the use of existing eligible lists; from three months to six months, appointments must be made from an appropriate eligible list, if available; for temporary appointments beyond six months, selection must be made from an appropriate eligible list, if available, from among the top three eligibles on the list willing to accept appointment.

At the time of this review, 14 temporary appointments were noted in the roster record. At the time of the review none of the temporary appointments exceeded one year. The temporary appointments were reviewed and found to be in accordance with the provisions of section 64 of the Civil Service Law.

Non-Competitive Appointments

Section 42(1) of the Civil Service Law prescribes that appointments to positions in the non-competitive class shall be made after a non-competitive examination prescribed by the Personnel Officer. Montgomery County Civil Service Rule III – Non-Competitive Class indicates, “A position in the non-competitive class may be filled by the appointment of a person who meets the minimum qualifications established for such position by the Personnel Officer. A nomination for such appointment shall state the qualifications of the nominee and shall be filed by the appointing authority with the Personnel Officer. Such appointment shall become effective only after approval by the Personnel Officer.”

A sample of non-competitive appointments was reviewed and found that the appointments were made according to Law and Rule. Applications of nominees for appointment to non-competitive class positions for all civil divisions under the jurisdiction of the Personnel Officer are generally received and reviewed prior to appointment and met the minimum qualifications for their respective positions. Only a few instances were found in which applications were not on file or were received after the appointment date.

The Personnel Officer must ensure that applications of all nominees for non-competitive class appointments are submitted and reviewed prior to appointment as required by section 42(1) of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rule III.

VII ROSTER RECORD

Section 97(1) of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XX – Reports of Appointing Officers require appointing officers to promptly report to the Personnel Officer detailed information relative to an employee’s employment history.

Section 97(2) of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XX requires the Personnel Officer to maintain an official roster detailing the employment history of each employee within the classified service.

Maintaining this official roster is one of the Personnel Officer’s most important responsibilities. Information in the roster record is used to determine an employee’s civil service rights, eligibility for promotion and/or retirement and the compensation to which he or she is entitled. Also, the roster record, absent an employee’s personal information, is a public record.

The Personnel Officer uses an electronic roster record system for all employees under his jurisdiction. The roster records contain complete information regarding an individual’s employment, including name, address, phone number, social security number, retirement system registration number, civil service history, title, salary, appointment status, authorization, and effective date of all personnel transactions. The information contained in the roster record is entered by Personnel Department staff. A hard copy of an employee’s roster record is maintained in an employee file folder along with other pertinent personnel transaction information. The folders are filed alphabetically by department. Updates to the roster records are made electronically through data entry of information on the computer system. A new copy of the roster record is generated with the new entries and filed in the employee’s file folder.

Reporting

As previously stated, reports of personnel transactions are required by Section 97 of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County’s Civil Service Rule XX, Reports of Appointing Officers. Timely receipt and review of personnel changes are necessary for a municipal civil service agency to fulfill its obligation to maintain an accurate employee roster.

In order to ensure the accurate reporting of transactions, municipal civil service agencies must establish a reporting procedure to be followed by appointing authorities that elicits all of the information needed by civil service to maintain the employee roster. Key to the success of any reporting procedure is the clear articulation of the information.

The Personnel Department uses a standard report of personnel change to collect personnel transaction information from all civil divisions under its jurisdiction. The reports of personnel changes are generally submitted on a timely basis. The roster record is subsequently updated or amended based on this reporting. Any issues are resolved through regular communication between the Personnel Department staff and the appointing authority or agency personnel staff and are resolved through the payroll certification process discussed further under this report.

Maintenance

In assessing the effectiveness of the Personnel Officer's maintenance of roster records, employee roster records were reviewed for accuracy and completeness. The roster record is well maintained. The information contained in the roster records is up to date with the exception of a few inaccuracies and/or incomplete information.

A list of these discrepancies is being provided to the Personnel Officer under separate cover.

It is critical that the roster record contain complete and accurate information because it serves as the official document of an individual's employment history, including status, dates, and types of appointments. The roster record provides the basis for employment decisions and clarification of public employees' civil service rights. An accurate and up-to-date roster record system is also necessary for effective payroll certification.

The Personnel Officer must review the roster record discrepancies identified on the separate listing, and confirm the correct status, jurisdictional classification, and authorization for appointment for each employee.

VIII PAYROLL CERTIFICATION

Section 100 of the Civil Service Law requires each agency under the jurisdiction of the Personnel Officer to submit payrolls for certification prior to payment at least once a year. Each municipal civil service agency may adopt a rule to prescribe the frequency of payroll certification. Rule XXI of the Montgomery County Civil Service Rules requires that payrolls be certified for the first payment of each fiscal year and, if required by the Personnel Officer, for the first payment for services in the second half of the fiscal year. The purpose of payroll certification is to ensure that all appointments and employments comport with the provisions of Civil Service Law and Rules.

The payroll certification process involves the Personnel Officer comparing the payroll against the official roster record to determine if each person included on the payroll is employed in his or her respective title and salary in accordance with Law and Rules. Additionally, the Personnel Officer is responsible for confirming employees' membership in the retirement system, which is verified by checking the payroll for the Employees' Retirement System membership information. The Personnel Officer and the appointing authority must resolve any discrepancies prior to payment of monies due the employee. Any public official who pays or authorizes payment to any employee not certified by the Personnel Officer may be held personally responsible under the law for the repayment of funds received by the employee.

Process and Compliance

The payrolls for all civil divisions under the jurisdiction of the Personnel Officer are certified twice a year, in January and July. The payroll for the County is based on an electronic comparison of information from civil service and the budget and essentially certified each pay period. At the time of the review, payrolls were available for all civil divisions.

While a payroll was available for each civil division, most were certified recently, after payment was made and not for the first full payment of the civil division's fiscal year. A sample comparison of the payrolls for the County, Towns, Villages and School Districts against the roster record found a few discrepancies. Most of the discrepancies had been noted by the Personnel Department staff. In those instances, exceptions have been noted, appropriate correspondence sent to the respective agencies, and the discrepancies had been or were being resolved. Where discrepancies are noted, the Personnel Officer attempts to resolve the problem by telephone or correspondence. In a few instances a payroll did not contain the signature of either the disbursing officer or the Personnel Officer. In addition, no Employees' Retirement System membership information was found on twelve of the non-county payrolls. It appears that the Personnel Officer attempts to certify most payrolls once received, but by not certifying payrolls prior to payment, he loses control over appointing authorities and disbursing officers to ensure that the employment of individuals on the payroll are in conformance with Civil Service Law and Rules.

The Personnel Officer must certify payrolls for all jurisdictions prior to payment in accordance with §100 of the Civil Service Law and Montgomery County Civil Service Rule XXI.

IX OTHER FACTORS**Office Staff and Equipment**

The Personnel Office is located on the 1st floor in the County Annex Building and is open from 8:30 a.m. to 4 p.m. Monday through Friday. The Personnel Department staff consists of a Personnel Associate and a Human Resources Clerk. The space, staff and equipment allocated to the Personnel Department are adequate for the administration of civil service.

SCHEDULE A

Agency	Title on Roster Record	Jurisdictional Classification on Roster Record
<u>County</u>		
Board of Supervisors	Administrative Aide	Unclassified
	Chairman-Board of Supervisors	Exempt
District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney-DWI Prosecutor	Exempt
	Criminal Investigator	PJC
MOSA	Director of Operations and Safety	Exempt
	Equipment and Fleet Manager	Exempt
Public Defender	Assistant Public Defender (PT) (2)	Exempt
Public Works	Custodial Maintenance Supervisor	Non-Competitive
	Working Sign Maintenance Supervisor	Labor
Real Property	Director of Real Property Tax	Non-Competitive
Sheriff	Assistant Cook	PJC
	Correction Facility Nurse	Non-Competitive
Stop DWI	DWI Coordinator	PJC
Youth	Youth Director/ACSD Director	PJC
<u>Special Districts</u>		
Fulton Montgomery		
Community College	Secretary to Board of Trustees	Exempt
Sanitary Sewer District 1	Maintenance Mechanic	Labor
	Superintendent	Non-Competitive
<u>Towns</u>		
Town of Amsterdam	Bookkeeper	PJC
	Sewer Inspector (PT)	Non-Competitive
Town of Charleston	Clerk/Typist	Non-Competitive
	Constable (PT)	Non-Competitive
	Court Clerk	Exempt
Town of Florida	Account Clerk (PT)	Non-Competitive
	Court Clerk (PT) (3)	Exempt
	Town Justice Clerk (PT)	Exempt
	Water Superintendent/Sewer Inspector	PJC
Town of Glen	Court Clerk	Exempt
Town of Minden	Account Clerk (PT)	Non-Competitive
	Board of Health Member	PJC
	Code/Zoning Enforcement Officer/Planning Chairman	PJC
	Town Health Officer (PT) (2)	Non-Competitive
Town of Mohawk	Account Clerk (PT)	Non-Competitive
	Sole Assessor	PJC
Town of Palatine	Court Clerk	Exempt
	Town Justice Clerk	PJC
Town of Root	Budget Officer	Exempt
<u>Villages</u>		
Village of Canajoharie	Code/Zoning Officer (PT) (2)	Non-Competitive
	Motor Equipment Operator	Non-Competitive
	Working Supervisor	Non-Competitive
Village of Fonda	Working Supervisor	Non-Competitive
Village of Fort Plain	Working Supervisor	Non-Competitive

Village of Fultonville	Street and Water Superintendent	Non-Competitive
Village of Hagaman	Street Commissioner	Non-Competitive
Village of St. Johnsville	Assistant Water Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator	Non-Competitive

School Districts

Canajoharie Central School District	Licensed Practical Nurse (PT) (2)	PJC
	School Monitor/Licensed Practical Nurse	PJC
Fonda-Fultonville School District	High School Conduct Coordinator	PJC
	Middle School Conduct Coordinator/Cleaner	PJC
	School District Treasurer	Exempt
Fort Plain Central School District	Secretary to School Superintendent	PJC
St. Johnsville School District	Tax Collector	Exempt
	Food Service Helpers (PT)	Labor
	Cleaners (PT)	Non-Competitive
	Teacher Aides	Non-Competitive
	Bus Drivers (PT)	Non-Competitive
	Clerk-Typists (PT)	Non-Competitive
	School Monitors	Labor

SCHEDULE B

<u>Agency</u>	<u>Title</u>
<u>County</u>	
County Attorney	*Assistant County Attorney
District Attorney	*Assistant District Attorney-DWI Prosecutor
	*Secretary to District Attorney
Emergency Management	*Director of Emergency Management
MOSA	*Director Operations and Safety
	*Equipment and Fleet Manager
Public Defender	*Confidential Secretary-Public Defender
Sheriff	*Confidential Secretary Sheriff
Youth	Youth Director/ACSD Director
	Community Service Program Clerk/Scheduler
<u>Special Districts</u>	
Fulton Montgomery Community College	*Secretary to Board of Trustees
Sanitary Sewer District #1	Superintendent
Soil and Water Conservation District	*Soil & Water District Secretary/Treasurer
<u>Towns</u>	
Town of Amsterdam	Bookkeeper
Town of Charleston	Constable
Town of Florida	Water Superintendent/Sewer Inspector
Town of Mohawk	Local Law Inspector
	Sole Assessor
Town Service	Budget Officer
Town Service	*Deputy Town Clerk
<u>School Districts</u>	
Canajoharie Central School District	Custodian
	School Monitor/Licensed Practical Nurse
	*Secretary to the School Superintendent
Fonda-Fultonville School District	*Secretary to School Superintendent
St. Johnsville School District	*School District Treasurer

*Listed in Montgomery County Civil Service Rules as Exempt